

Reconciling Experimental with Theoretical Relationships

When students graph relationships between variables in relationships that contain known proportionality constants such as “g”, how does one extract such terms from the proportionality constant if it is known to be present?

Consider the traditional pendulum lab conducted in a region where the acceleration due to gravity is 9.810m/s^2 . When students graph period squared (t^2) versus length (l) to get a linearized relationship, they find a proportionality constant of approximately $4.024\text{s}^2/\text{m}$. That is,

$$t^2 = \left(4.024 \frac{\text{s}^2}{\text{m}}\right)l$$

Writing this in the more traditional form yields the following version of the relationship:

$$t = 2.006 \frac{\text{s}}{\text{m}^{1/2}} \sqrt{l}$$

Now, how does one extract “g” from this experimentally determined constant so that students can reconcile the relationship with the theoretically derived form that frequently appears in textbooks as follows?

$$t = 2\pi \sqrt{\frac{l}{g}}$$

That is, how can one logically show that $2.006\text{s}/\text{m}^{1/2} = 2\pi/\sqrt{g}$ in this case? The answer resides with the use of dimensional analysis. Consider the following dimensional analysis assuming t is a function of l and g and starting with the assumed form of the relationship:

$$\begin{aligned} t &\propto l^x g^y \\ \text{s}^1 &\propto \text{m}^x \left(\frac{\text{m}}{\text{s}^2}\right)^y \\ \text{m}^0 \text{s}^1 &\propto \text{m}^{x+y} \text{s}^{-2y} \end{aligned}$$

Now, equating exponents on s and m respectively one finds:

$$\begin{aligned} 1 &= -2y & \text{and} & & 0 &= x + y \\ y &= -\frac{1}{2} & & & 0 &= x - \frac{1}{2} \\ & & & & x &= \frac{1}{2} \end{aligned}$$

Inserting the exponents of x and y and replacing the proportionality with an equality sign and proportionality constant in the assumed form of the relationship $t \propto l^x g^y$ yields

$$t = \text{const} \sqrt{\frac{l}{g}}$$

Now, gathering all constant terms in this equation yields:

$$t = \frac{\text{const}}{\sqrt{g}} \sqrt{l}$$

Equating the two sets of constants in the experimental and theoretical forms of the relationships respectively, one gets:

$$2.006 \frac{s^2}{m} = \frac{\text{const}}{\sqrt{g}}$$

$$\text{const} = 2.006 \frac{s^2}{m} \sqrt{g}$$

$$\text{const} = 2.006 \frac{s^2}{m} \sqrt{\frac{9.810m}{s^2}}$$

$$\text{const} = 6.283$$

$$\text{const} = 2\pi \quad (\text{approximately})$$

Hence, replacing the experimentally determined proportionality constant $2.006s^2/m$ with $2\pi/\sqrt{g}$ yields an experimental formula that is completely consistent with the theoretical version.

$$t = 2\pi \sqrt{\frac{l}{g}}$$